

DAVID ASSAF

CAUGHT IN THE THICKET

CHAPTERS OF CRISIS AND DISCONTENT
IN THE HISTORY OF HASIDISM

The Zalman Shazar Center for Jewish History
Jerusalem

ISBN 965-227-216-7

Catalogue No. 185-535

© Copyright by The Zalman Shazar Center for Jewish History, Jerusalem

Printed in Israel, 2006

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording or any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher.

Typesetting: The Zalman Shazar Center

Printing: Graphit Press Ltd., Jerusalem

CONTENTS

Preface	11
Introduction: On History, Embarrassment, and Discontent	
I. Methodology and Content	15
II. ‘Lies My Teacher Told Me’: Hasidic History as a Battlefield	19
III. Orthodoxy’s Strategies of Memory and Repressed Memory in the Face of Crisis and Embarrassment	25
IV. ‘I Am also Not Objective’: History as it Should Have Happened	48
Chapter One: Apostate or Saint? In the Footsteps of Moshe, the Son of Rabbi Shneur Zalman of Lyady	
I. ‘Would that My Parents Were Cruel’: Sons of Zaddikim and Rabbis who Left the Fold	51
II. ‘I Will Make the Sign of the Cross Just to Upset You’: Conversion and the Parent – Child Relationship	55
III. Polemic Memory and Apologetic Memory	60
IV. ‘Our Well Known Brother’: Moshe Before His Conversion	62
V. Leon Yulievitz or Piotr Aleksandrovitz? The Archival Testimony	70
VI. ‘He Was of Sound Mind’: Traditions of Memory Among the Maskilim	76
VII. ‘The Man Was Completely Sane’: Testimony of the Converts	87
VIII. In the Historian’s Workshop	94
IX. ‘The Time Has Come for Moshe’s Story to be Revealed’: Traditions of Hasidic Memory	108
X. ‘He First Went Insane and Only Then Converted’	125
XI. ‘It Never Happened’? The Continuing Struggle Over the Memory	128
Appendices	
1. Moshe’s Statement About His Desire to Convert	131
2. Moshe’s Certificate of Baptism	132
3. A Letter From Moshe’s Brothers Dov Ber (The Middle Rebbe) and Hayyim Abraham About the Conversion	133
4. The Burial Listings of Moshe’s Daughters in Jerusalem	136

Chapter Two: ‘The Mitnagdim Laughed that He Was Drunk’:

The Fall of the Seer of Lublin

I.	‘A Flame Hovers Over His Head’: The Seer of Lublin in the Eyes of His Hasidim	137
II.	The Fall of the Seer of Lublin in the Hasidic Tradition of Memory	139
III.	‘Silly and Stupid’: The Seer of Lublin in the Eyes of His Opponents	145
IV.	<i>Ma’asei Ha-Rav</i> (The Rabbi’s Deeds) or <i>Sefer Nekiyut U-Frishut</i> (The Book of Cleanliness and Abstinence)? On the Textual History and the Author’s Identity	147
V.	<i>Sefer Nekiyut U-Frishut</i> : Content and Structure	154
VI.	‘I Fell Down Drunk’: Echoes of the Fall in Maskilic Literature	156
VII.	Did The Seer of Lublin Commit Suicide?	162
	Appendix: <i>Sefer Nekiyut U-Frishut</i>	166

Chapter Three: ‘Happy Are the Persecuted’: The Struggle Against Bratslav Hasidism

I.	Three Waves of Persecution	179
II.	‘A Fearful and Upsetting Scene’: Testimony of the Maskilim	182
III.	The Struggle of Talne Hasidim Against Bratslav	187
IV.	The Rzhishchev Affair and the Decree Against Travel by Zaddikim	189
V.	‘The Bratslav Hasidim Eat <i>Treyf</i> ’: The Scandal in Teplik	199
VI.	‘They Are Not Beholden to Any of the Leaders of Our Time’: The Obligation to Obey and Motives for Struggle	204
VII.	‘The Lord Seeks the Persecuted’: Impressions of the Persecutions in Bratslav Historiography	208
VIII.	Continuity of the Persecutions	215
IX.	‘Legacy of a Mistake’: An Epilogue?	217
	Appendix: ‘The Outrage that Was Perpetrated in Our Town of Teplik’	222

Chapter Four: ‘Heretic, Who Believes Not in the Great Leaders of the Time’: The Struggle Over the Honor of the Book *Or Ha-Hayyim*

I.	Hasidic Attitudes Toward Rabbi Hayyim Ben Attar	235
II.	‘A Melamed Insulted the Honor of <i>Or Ha-Hayyim</i> ’: Responsa of Rabbi Hayyim Halberstam of Zanz	237
III.	‘An Ignorant and Illiterate Person’: More Responses	241

IV. 'I Will Cry from My Bitter Soul': The Letter of the Melamed from Siven	242
V. Between 'The Holy Spirit' and 'Yeshivah and Toil': Social and Ideological Motives	247
VI. Reverberations: The Honor of the Book <i>Mishnah Berurah</i>	251
VII. From <i>Emunat Hakhamim</i> (The Faith in the Torah Sages) to <i>Da'at Torah</i> (The Torah's Opinion)	252

Chapter Five: 'Excitement of the Soul': The World of Rabbi Akiva Shalom Chajes of Tulchin

I. From Enemy to Friend	255
II. His Literary Legacy	256
III. 'Out of My House, Impure One!': Rabbi Akiva Chajes in Light of the Memoir Literature	259
IV. Rabbi Akiva Chajes's Conversion of the Heart	269
V. The Nomination of Akiva Chajes as Rabbi of Dubova and 'The <i>Ka-Davar</i> Controversy'	276
VI. Entanglement of Memory	281

Chapter Six: 'How Much Times Have Changed': The World of Rabbi Menachem Nahum Friedman of Ițcani

I. Hasidism and Philosophy	283
II. On the History of Rabbi Menachem Nahum Friedman	285
III. His Literary Legacy	289
IV. 'Religious Zeal Is a Plague Recounted in the Torah': Between Innovation and Conservatism	302
V. Disregard or Polemic? The Book <i>Ha-Tov Ve-Ha-Takhlit</i> (The Good and the Purpose)	306
VI. 'How Much Times Have Changed!': A Humanist Among Hasidim?	310
VII. 'What Befell the Rebbe's Grandchildren Who Left the Fold?'	311
VIII. 'It Is Forbidden to Have This Book'	314

Chapter Seven: 'Confession of My Tortured Soul': The World of Rabbi Yitzhak Nahum Twersky of Shpikov

I. Shpikov Hasidism	317
II. On the History of Rabbi Yitzhak Nahum Twersky	319
III. 'Praise for Your Bravery': The Twersky Sisters	322

V. 'A Sacrifice on My Mother's Altar': The Value of the Confession	326
V. 'Caught Up in the Current of That Generation': The Historical Context	330
VI. 'My Tiny and Ugly World': Full Text of the Confession	332
Bibliography	349
Indices	359