

MR3097051 (Review) 01A35 01A20

[Corry, Leo \(IL-TLAV-NDM\)](#)

Geometry and arithmetic in the medieval traditions of Euclid's *Elements*: a view from Book II. (English summary)

*Arch. Hist. Exact Sci.* **67** (2013), no. 6, 637–705.

Sabetai Unguru's 1975 paper "On the need to rewrite the history of Greek mathematics" [Arch. History Exact Sci. **15** (1975/76), no. 1, 67–114; MR0504604 (58 #21009)], in which he argued that the then-current algebraic understanding of the geometric propositions of Book II of Euclid's *Elements* seriously undermines proper reflection on how the Greeks understood it, set off a firestorm that eventually helped to reshape the historiography of mathematics. This article attempts to build directly from Unguru by developing a nuanced approach to various medieval editions and recastings of the content of Book II. The major issue, then and now, is the struggle over Euclid's strict distinction between a purely geometric approach in Book II (dealing with magnitudes in general), and his arithmetic approach in later books (dealing with numbers). The various medieval authors (al-Khwārizmī, Abū Kāmil, Thābit ibn Qurra, and al-Nayrīzī in Islam; Abraham bar Ḥiyya, the *Liber Mahameleth*, Fibonacci, Jordanus Nemorarius, Campanus, Levi ben Gerson, and Barlaam in Latin Europe) all take differing but related approaches to either upholding the barrier or breaking it down. Some rely on the authority of geometric methods while others lean toward numerical proofs, even in some cases a sort of proto-algebra; some keep the content completely general, while others mix in specific numeric examples of the theorems.

The analysis in this paper provides much-needed linguistic and conceptual distinctions, opening a door to approaches to these texts that are more respectful of their historical contexts. It is an important contribution to work in this manner from Unguru's paper, and one hopes that will take less than 40 years for the story to be elaborated further.

[Glen R. Van Brummelen](#)

## References

1. Archibald, Raymond C. 1913. *Euclid's book on divisions of figures with a restoration based on the Woepcke's text and on the practica geometriae of Leonardo Pisano*. Cambridge: The University Press.
2. Billingsley, Henry. 1570. *The elements of geometrie of the most auncient philosopher Euclide of Megara*. London. Imprinted by Iohn Daye.
3. Brentjes, Sonja. 1994. Textzeugen und Hypothesen zum arabischen Euklid in der Überlieferung von al-Hağğāğ b. Yūsuf b. Mtar (zwischen 786 und 833). *Archive for History of Exact Sciences* 47: 53–92. MR1282105 (95h:01009)
4. Brentjes, Sonja. 1996. The relevance of non-primary sources for the recovery of the primary transmission of Euclid's *Elements* into Arabic. In *Tradition, transmission, transformation: Proceedings of two conferences on pre-modern science held at the university of Oklahoma*, ed. F. Jamil Ragep, Sally P. Ragep, and Steve Livesey, 201–225. Brill: Leiden. MR1463482 (98m:01002)
5. Brentjes, Sonja. 1997/1998. Additions to Book I in the Arabic traditions of Euclid's *Elements*. *Studies in History of Medicine and Science* 15(1–2): 55–117. MR1786281 (2001f:01018)
6. Brentjes, Sonja. 2001a. Observations on Hermann of Carinthia's version of the *Elements* and its relation to the Arabic transmission. *Science in Context* 14(1–2):

- 39–84. [MR1892194](#) (2003c:01015)
7. Brentjes, Sonja. 2001b. Two comments on Euclid's *Elements*? On the relation between the Arabic text attributed to al-Nayrīzī and the Latin text ascribed to Anaritius. *Centaurus* 43: 17–55. [MR1816355](#) (2002m:01003)
  8. Busard, Hubertus L.L. 1968. *The translation of the Elements of Euclid from the Arabic into Latin by Hermann of Carinthia (?)*. Edited with an Introduction. Leiden: Brill. [MR0243973](#) (39 #5291)
  9. Busard, Hubertus L.L. 1983. *The first Latin translation of Euclid's 'Elements', commonly ascribed to Adelard of Bath*. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies.
  10. Busard, Hubertus L.L. 1984. *The Latin translation of the Arabic version of Euclid's 'Elements', commonly ascribed to Gerard of Cremona*. Leiden: Brill.
  11. Busard, Hubertus L.L. 1987. *The medieval Latin translation of Euclid's Elements made directly from the Greek*. Stuttgart: Steiner Verlag. [MR0927086](#) (89g:01004)
  12. Busard, Hubertus L.L. 1991. *Jordanus de Nemore, De elementis arithmeticis artis: A medieval treatise on number theory*, 2 vols. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag. [MR1152799](#) (93e:01004a)
  13. Busard, Hubertus L.L. 1992. The *Arithmetica* of Jordanus Nemorarius. In *Amphora: Festschrift for Hans Wussing on the occasion of his 65th birthday*, ed. S.S. Demidov, et al., 121–132. Basel-Boston-Berlin: Birkhäuser Verlag. [MR1192320](#) (93i:01010)
  14. Busard, Hubertus L.L. 1996a. A thirteenth-century adaptation of Robert of Chester's version of Euclid's *Elements*. München: Institut für Geschichte der Naturwissenschaften.
  15. Busard, Hubertus L.L. 1996b. Einiges über die Handschrift Leiden 399,1 und die arabisch-lateinische Übersetzung von Gerhard von Cremona. In *History of mathematics: States of the art*, ed. J. Dauben, M. Folkerts, and H. Wussing, 173–205. San Diego: Academic Press. [MR1388790](#) (98a:01003)
  16. Busard, Hubertus L.L. 2005. *Campanus of Novara and Euclid's Elements*, 2 vols. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag. [MR2219456](#) (2007a:01002)
  17. Busard, Hubertus L.L., and Menso Folkerts. 1992. *Robert of Chester's (?) redaction of Euclid's Elements, the so-called Adelard II Version*, 2 vols. Basel-Boston-Berlin: Birkhäuser Verlag. [MR1269779](#) (95k:01003)
  18. Clagett, Marshall. 1978. *Archimedes in the Middle Ages. Volume iii: The fate of the medieval Archimedes, 1300–1565*. Philadelphia: American Philosophical Society. [MR0523009](#) (80g:01006)
  19. Corry, Leo. 2004. *Modern algebra and the rise of mathematical structures*, 2nd ed. Basel-Boston-Berlin: Birkhäuser. [MR2033171](#) (2004k:01037)
  20. Corry, Leo. forthcoming. The law of distributivity in the medieval traditions of Euclid's *Elements*: Between geometry and arithmetic. (Cited throughout as [LC2]).
  21. Corry, Leo, and Norbert Schappacher. 2010. Zionist internationalism through Number Theory: Edmund Landau at the opening of the Hebrew University in 1925. *Science in Context* 23(4): 427–471. [MR2745962](#)
  22. Curtze, Maximilian. 1899. *Anaritii in decem libros primos elementorum Euclidis commentarii ex interpretatione Gherardi Cremonensis in codice Cracoviense 569 servata*, Leipzig: Teubner (*Euclidis Opera Omnia*, I.L. Heiberg et H. Menge (eds.), supplementum).
  23. Curtze, Maximilian. 1902. *Der Liber Embadorum des Abraham bar Chijja Salsoda in der Übersetzung des Plato von Tivoli*. *Abhandlungen zur Geschichte der mathematischen Wissenschaften* 12: 1–183.
  24. Djebbar, Ahmed. 2005. *L'algèbre arabe. Genèse d'un art*. Paris: Vuibert. [MR2538093](#) (2010k:01002)

25. Dold-Samplonius, Yvonne. 1987. Developments in the solution to the Equation  $cx^2 + bx = a$  from al-Khwarizmi to Fibonacci. In *From deferent to equant: A volume of studies in the history of science in the ancient and medieval Near East in Honor of E.S. Kennedy*, vol. 500, ed. David A. King, and Georg Saliba, 71–87. New York: Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences. [MR1106203](#)
26. Eastwood, Bruce S. 2007. *Ordering the heavens: Roman astronomy and cosmology in the Carolingian renaissance*. Brill: Leiden.
27. Folkerts, Menso. 1970. *Boethius "Geometrie II": ein mathematisches Lehrbuch des Mittelalters*. Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner. [MR0305961 \(46 \#5089\)](#)
28. Folkerts, Menso. 1981. The importance of the Pseudo-Boethian Geometria during the Middle Ages. In *Boethius and the Liberal Arts: A collection of essays*, Berne, ed. M. Masi, 187–209, (Reprinted in Menso Folkerts 2003), *Essays on early medieval mathematics: The Latin tradition*. Aldershot: Ashgate). [MR2148671 \(2005m:01001\)](#)
29. Folkerts, Menso. 1989. *Euclid in medieval Europe*. Winnipeg: The Benjamin Catalogue.
30. Folkerts, Menso. 2004. Leonardo Fibonacci's knowledge of Euclid's *Elements* and of other mathematical texts. *Bollettino di Storia della Scienze Matematiche* 24: 93–114. [MR2163493 \(2006f:01010\)](#)
31. Folkerts, Menso. 2006. *The development of mathematics in medieval Europe: The Arabs, Euclid, Regiomontanus*. Aldershot: Ashgate Publishing Limited. [MR2229235 \(2007d:01001\)](#)
32. Freudenthal, Hans. 1977. What is Algebra and What has it been in History. *Archive for History of Exact Sciences* 16(3): 189–200. [MR0530740 \(58 \#26699\)](#)
33. Fried, Michael N., and Sabetai Unguru. 2001. *Apollonius of Perga's Conica: Text, Context, Subtext*. Leiden: Brill. [MR1929435 \(2004e:01006\)](#)
34. Goldstein, Bernard. 1965. A treatise on Number Theory from a tenth century Arabic source. *Centaurus* 10: 124–160. [MR0175733 \(31 \#10\)](#)
35. Goulding, Robert. 2010. *Defending Hypatia: Ramus, Savile, and the renaissance rediscovery of mathematical history*. Dordrecht, Heidelberg, London, New York: Springer.
36. Guillaumin, Jean-Yves. 2012. Boethius' *De institutione arithmeticā* and its influence on posterity. In *A companion to Boethius in the Middle Ages*, ed. Noel H. Kaylor, and Philip E. Phillips, 135–162. Leiden: Brill.
37. Guttmann, Yehiel Michael HaCohen. 1912–1913. *Chibbur Ha-Meschicha WeHa-Tischboreth: Lehrbuch der geometrie des Abraham bar Chija*, vol. 2. Berlin: Schriften des Vereins Mekize Nirdamim.
38. Heath, Thomas. 1956[1908], *The thirteen Books of Euclid's Elements*. New York: Dover. [MR0075873 \(17,814b\)](#)
39. Heath, Thomas. (1981)[1921]. *History of Greek mathematics*, vol. 2. New York: Dover. [MR0654679 \(84h:01002a\)](#)
40. Heiberg, Johan Ludvig, and Heinrich Menge. 1883–1893. *Euclidis opera omnia. Ediderunt et latine interpretati sunt I. L. Heiberg et H. Menge*, vol. 12. Leipzig: Teubner.
41. Hogendijk, Jan P. 2005. Al-Nayrīzī's influence in the West. (Downloaded February 14, 2010, from <http://www.jphogendijk.nl/publ/naywest.pdf>).
42. Høyrup, Jens. 1986. Al-Khwārizmī, Ibn Turk, and the Liber Mensurationum: On the origins of Islamic Algebra. *Erdem* 2: 445–484.
43. Høyrup, Jens. 1988. Jordanus de Nemore, 13th century mathematical innovator. *Archive for History of Exact Science* 38: 307–363. [MR0958988 \(89i:01010\)](#)
44. Høyrup, Jens. 1998. A new art in ancient clothes. Itineraries chosen between scholasticism and baroque in order to make Algebra appear legitimate, and their impact

- on the substance of the discipline. *Physis, Nuova Serie* 35: 11–50. [MR1723087 \(2000m:01016\)](#)
45. Høyrup, Jens. 2001. On a collection of geometrical riddles and their role in the shaping of four to six ‘Algebras’. *Science in Context* 14(1–2): 85–131. [MR1892195 \(2003b:01005\)](#)
46. Høyrup, Jens. 2010. Hesitating progress: the slow development toward algebraic symbolization in abbacus and related manuscripts, c. 1300 to c. 1550. In *Philosophical aspects of symbolic reasoning in Early Modern Mathematics* (Studies in Logic, 26), ed. Albrecht Heeffer, and Maarten Van Dyck, 3–56. London: College Publications. [MR2848642 \(2012j:01015\)](#)
47. Hughes, Barnabas. 1981. *Jordanus de Nemore. De numeris datis. A Critical edition and translation.* Berkeley-Los Angeles-London: University of California Press. [MR0642669 \(83k:01009\)](#)
48. Hughes, Barnabas. 2008. *Fibonacci’s De practica geometrie.* New York: Springer (Sources and Studies in the History of Mathematics and Physical Sciences).
49. Kibre, Pearl. 1981. The Boethian *De institutione arithmetica* and the quadrivium in the thirteenth century University Milieu at Paris. In *Boethius and the liberal arts: A collection of essays*, ed. Michael Masi, 67–80. Bern/Frankfurt: Peter Lang.
50. Klein, Jacob. 1968. [1934–1936], *Greek mathematical thought and the origin of Algebra (Translated by Eva Brann. With an appendix containing Vieta’s Introduction to the analytical art, translated by J. Winfree Smith).* Cambridge, MA: MIT Press. [MR0472317 \(57 #12019\)](#)
51. Lange, Gerson. 1909. *Sefer Maassei Chosheb. Die Praxis des Rechners. Ein hebräisch-arithmetisches Werk des Levi ben Gerschom aus dem Jahre 1321.* Frankfurt am Main: Louis Golde.
52. Lefèvre d’Étaples, Jacques. 1496. *Arithmetica decem libris demonstrate.* Paris: Johannes Higman and Wolfgang Hopyl
53. Levey, Martin. 1966. *The Algebra of Abū Kāmil. Kitāb fī al-jābr wa’l-muqābala, in a commentary by Mordecai Finzi* (Hebrew Text, Translation and Commentary with Special Reference to the Arabic Text). Madison: University of Wisconsin Press. [MR0205787 \(34 #5613\)](#)
54. Lévy, Tony. 1992. Gersonide, commentateur d’Euclide: Traduction annotée de ses gloses sur les *Elements*. In *Studies on Gersonides: A Fourteenth-Century Jewish Philosopher-Scientist. Collection de Travaux de L’Académie Internationale d’Histoire des Sciences*, vol. 36, ed. Gad Freudenthal, 83–148. Leiden: Brill.
55. Lévy, Tony. 1997a. Les ‘Eléments’ d’Euclide en hébreu (XIIIe–XVIe siècles). In *Perspectives arabes et médiévales sur la tradition scientifique et philosophique grecque*, ed. M. Aouad, A. Elamrani-Jamal, and A. Hasnaoui, 79–94. Leuven: Peeters. [MR1795986](#)
56. Lévy, Tony. 1997b. Une version hébraïque inédite des ‘Eléments’ d’Euclide. In *Les voies de la science grecque*, ed. D. Jacquot, 181–239. Geneva: Droz. [MR1607904 \(99g:01011\)](#)
57. Lévy, Tony. 1997c. The establishment of the mathematical bookshelf of the medieval Hebrew scholar: Translations and translators. *Science in Context* 10(03): 431–451. [MR1647024 \(99g:01012\)](#)
58. Lévy, Tony. 2001. Les débuts de la littérature mathématique hébraïque: la géométrie d’Abraham bar Hiyya (XIe–XIIe s.). *Micrologus* 9: 35–64. [MR2168435 \(2006e:01006\)](#)
59. Lo Bello, Anthony. 2003a. *Gerard of Cremona’s translation of the commentary of Al-Nayrizi on Book I of Euclid’s Elements of geometry. With an introductory account of the twenty-two early extant Arabic manuscripts of the Elements.* Leiden: Brill.
60. Lo Bello, Anthony. 2003b. *The commentary of Albertus magnus on Book I of Euclid’s*

- Elements of geometry*. Leiden: Brill.
61. Lo Bello, Anthony. 2009. *The commentary of al-Nayrizí on Books II-IV of Euclid's Elements of geometry. With a translation of that portion of Book I missing from MS Leiden Or. 399.1, but present in the newly discovered Qom manuscript* ed. Rüdiger Arnzen. Leiden: Brill.
  62. Luckey, Paul. 1941. Tabit b. Qurra über den geometrischen Richtigkeitsnachweis der Auflösung der quadratischen Gleichungen. *Sächsischen Akademie der Wissenschaften zu Leipzig. Mathematisch-physische Klasse. Berichte* 93: 93–114. [MR0031430 \(11,150l\)](#)
  63. Millás-Valllicrosa, José María. 1931. *Abraam bar Hia, Llibre de geometría. Hibbur hameixihà uehatibxoret*. Barcelona: Editorial Alpha.
  64. Moyon, Mark. 2007. La tradition algébrique arabe du traité d'Al-Khwârizmî au Moyen Âge latin et la place de la Géométrie. In *Histoire et enseignement des mathématiques. Rigueurs, erreurs, raisonnements*, ed. Evelyne Barbin, and Dominique Bénard, 289–318. Lyon: INRP.
  65. Mueller, Ian. 1981. *Philosophy of mathematics and deductive structure in Euclid's Elements*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press. [MR0632259 \(84j:01013\)](#)
  66. Murdoch, John. 1966. Euclides Graeco-Latinus: A Hitherto unknown medieval Latin translation of the Elements made directly from the Greek. *Harvard Studies in Classical Philology* 71:249–302.
  67. Murdoch, John. 1968. The medieval Euclid: Salient aspects of the translations of the *Elements* by Adelard of Bath and Campanus of Novara. *Revue de synthèse (ser.II)* 1: 64–94.
  68. Murdoch, John. 1971. Euclid: Transmission of the *Elements*. *Dictionary of Scientific Biography* 4: 437–459.
  69. Murdoch, John. 2003. Transmission into use: The evidence of Marginalia in the medieval Euclides Latinus. *Revue d'histoire des sciences* 56(2): 369–382. [MR2040718 \(2004k:01018\)](#)
  70. Neal, Katherine. 2002. *From discrete to continuous: The broadening of the number concepts in Early Modern England*. Dordrecht: Kluwer. [MR2044069 \(2005f:01007\)](#)
  71. Netz, Reviel. 1999. *The shaping of deduction in Greek mathematics: A study in cognitive history*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. [MR1683176 \(2000f:01003\)](#)
  72. Oaks, Jeffrey. 2001. Geometry and proof in Abū Kāmil's Algebra. In *Actes du 10ème Colloque Maghrébin sur l'Histoire des Mathématiques Arabes*, 234–256. Tunis: L'Association Tunisienne des Sciences Mathématiques.
  73. Oaks, Jeffrey. 2011. Al-Khayyām's scientific revision of Algebra. *Suhayl: Journal for the History of the Exact and Natural Sciences in Islamic Civilisation* 10: 47–75. [MR2964281](#)
  74. Puig, Luis. 1994. El De Numeris Datis de Jordanus Nemorarius como sistema matemático de signos. *Mathesis* 10: 47–94. [MR1280864 \(95f:01010\)](#)
  75. Rabinovitch, Nahum L. 1970. Rabbi Levi ben Gershon and the origins of mathematical induction. *Archive for History of Exact Sciences* 6: 237–248. [MR1554128](#)
  76. Rommevaux, Sabine. 1999. La proportionnalité numérique dans le Livre VII des Éléments de Campanus. *Revue d'histoire des mathématiques* 5: 83–126. [MR1756620 \(2001b:01006\)](#)
  77. Rommevaux, Sabine. 2008. The transmission of the Elements to the Latin West: three case studies. In *The Oxford handbook of the history of mathematics*, ed. Eleanor Robson and Jackie Stedall, 687–706. Oxford: Oxford University Press. [MR2549261 \(2011e:01001\)](#)
  78. Rommevaux, Sabine, Ahmed Djebbar, and Bernard Vitrac. 2001. Remarques sur l'Histoire du Texte des Éléments d'Euclide. *Archive for History of Exact Sciences*

- 55: 221–295. [MR1813915](#) (2002f:01006)
79. Rose, Paul Lawrence. 1975. *The Italian Renaissance of mathematics: Studies on humanists and mathematicians from Petrarch to Galileo*. Genève: Librairie Droz. [MR0531405](#) (58 #26851)
80. Rosen, Frederic 1831. *The Algebra of Mohammed ben Musa*. London: Murray.
81. Saito, Ken. (2004) [1985]. Book II of Euclid's *Elements* in the light of the theory of conic sections. *Historia Scientiarum* 28: 31–60 (Reprinted in Jean Christianidis (ed.), *Classics in the History of Greek Mathematics*, Boston Studies in the Philosophy of Science, Vol. 240, Dordrecht-Boston: Kluwer, pp. 139–168). [MR0794045](#) (86k:01007)
82. Saito, Ken, and Nathan Sidoli. 2012. Diagrams and arguments in ancient Greek mathematics: Lessons drawn from comparisons of the manuscript diagrams with those of modern critical editions. In *The history of mathematical proof in ancient traditions*, ed. Karine Chemla, 135–162. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
83. Sarfatti, Gad B. 1968. *Mathematical terminology in Hebrew Scientific Literature of the Middle Ages* .... Jerusalem: Magnes Press. [MR0270870](#) (42 #5756)
84. Sesiano, Jacques. 1987. Survivance médiévale en Hispanie d'un problème né en Mésopotamie. *Centaurus* 30(1): 18–61. [MR0907575](#) (88i:01022)
85. Sesiano, Jacques. 1993. La version latine médiévale de l'Algèbre d'Abū Kāmil. In *Vestigia Mathematica. Studies in Medieval and Early Modern Mathematics in Honour of H. L. L. Busard*, ed. Menso Folkerts, and Jan P. Hogendijk, 315–452. Amsterdam et Atlanta: Rodopi. [MR1258834](#) (95d:01006)
86. Sigler, Laurence E. 2002. *Fibonacci's Liber Abaci. A translation into Modern English of Leonardo Pisano's Book of Calculation*. New York: Springer (Sources and Studies in the History of Mathematics and Physical Sciences).
87. Simi, Annalisa. 2004. L'eredità della *Practica geometriae* di Leonardo Pisano nella geometria del basso Medioevo e del primo Rinascimento. *Bollettino di Storia delle Scienze Matematiche* 24: 9–43. [MR2163495](#) (2006f:01013)
88. Simonson, Shai. 2000a. The missing problems of Gersonides—A critical edition. *Historia Mathematica* 27(3):243–302. [MR1784431](#) (2001f:01024)
89. Simonson, Shai. 2000b. The missing problems of Gersonides—A critical edition. *Historia Mathematica* 27(4):384–431. [MR1800319](#) (2001h:01011)
90. Tummers, Paul M.J.E. 1980. The commentary of Albert on Euclid's Elements of Geometry. In *Albertus Magnus and the Sciences: Commemorative Essays*, ed. J.A. Weisheipl, 479–498. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies.
91. Tummers, Paul M.J.E. 1994. *Anaritius' commentary on Euclid. The Latin translation I-IV* (Artistarum Supplementa IX). Nijmegen: Ingenium Publishers.
92. Unguru, Sabetai. 1975. On the need to rewrite the history of Greek mathematics. *Archive for History of Exact Sciences* 15: 67–114. [MR0504604](#) (58 #21009)
93. Unguru, Sabetai and David Rowe. 1981–1982a. Does the Quadratic Equation have Greek Roots? *Libertas Mathematica* 1: 1–49. [MR0623363](#) (82m:01012)
94. Unguru, Sabetai, and David Rowe. 1981–1982b. Does the Quadratic Equation have Greek Roots? *Libertas Mathematica* 2: 1–62. [MR0675391](#) (84c:01009)
95. van der Waerden, Bartel L. 1976. Defense of a 'Shocking' point of view. *Archive for History of Exact Sciences* 15: 199–210. [MR0530870](#) (58 #26715)
96. Vitrac, Bernard. 2003. Les scholies grecques aux Éléments d'Euclide. *Revue d'histoire des sciences* 56: 275–292. [MR2040714](#) (2004k:01008)
97. Vitrac, Bernard. 2004. A propos des démonstrations alternatives et autres substitutions de preuves dans les Éléments d'Euclide. *Archive for History of Exact Sciences* 59: 1–44. [MR2104138](#) (2005h:01003)
98. Vitrac, Bernard. 2011. *Faut-il réhabiliter Héron d'Alexandrie?* Montpellier: France. (Downloaded May 02, 2012, from <http://hal-paris1.archives-ouvertes.fr/hal->

- 00454027).
99. Vitrac, Bernard, and Maurice Caveing. 1990. *Euclide d'Alexandrie. Les Éléments. Traduit du texte de Heiberg (Vol. I. Introduction générale par Maurice Caveing. Livres I-IV: géométrie plane. Traduction et commentaires par Bernard Vitrac)*. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France. [MR1084165](#) (92e:01012)
  100. Vlasschaert, Anne-Marie. 2012. *Le Liber Mahameleth: Édition critique et commentaires*. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag. [MR2741809](#) (2012b:01007)
  101. Weil, André. 1978. Who betrayed Euclid? *Archive for History of Exact Sciences* 19: 91–94. [MR0484928](#) (58 #4793)
  102. Weinberg, Josef. 1935. *Die Algebra des Abū Kāmil Šoḡā’ben Aslam*. München: Druck der Salesianischen Offizin.

*Note: This list reflects references listed in the original paper as accurately as possible with no attempt to correct errors.*

© Copyright American Mathematical Society 2015