ז"ט

העריכה: מיכאל טור, נדב נאמן, יורם עזר, משה רוסמן

מזכיר העריכה: יוחנן חווכ

שה פא • ג–ד • תשע”ד

רביעי לזכרו של לדורות ישראל

החברה ההיסטורית לישראל • ירושלים
Marc B. Shapiro, Changing the Immutable: How Orthodox Judaism Rewrites Its History

בְּדַרְשָּׁרִיָּר: נָמָרִי שְׁלוֹחַ: נְטוּיָה חָפְצֵה, מַחְפְּצֵה הָעִנָּה: אִישֶּׁה וְרָכַב בָּאָרֶץ יִשְׂרָאֵל;

1945–1907

סֶפֶרִים שְׁנַיְכוּלָּם בְּמַעֲרָבָּה

סֶפֶרִים יְדָעַת בְּאֶגְנָלָה XXV
the function of the halakhah in the inner world of Shabbetai Zevi, and the manner
in which he communicated with his community as the messiah of the masses.

Shabbetai Zevi’s personal declarations, letters, and also the ‘strange doings’ for
which he acquired a reputation in the course of his years of activity, are analyzed
and deciphered in light of their close relationship to normative halakhah. A close
examination of these diverse gestures reveals the importance for Shabbetai Zevi
of halakhic stringency. From here a new impression of his inner world and of
his messianic pretensions emerges. Shabbetai Zevi was a messiah who was strict
about the legal minutiae of Judaism, even after his conversion. He creatively
incorporated different halakhic traditions such as the tradition of penitence
(teshuvat hamishqal) of the German pietists, the dispensation for a prophet to rule
on the annulment of certain religious laws just as a ‘temporary measure’ (hora’at
sha’ah) as referred to by Maimonides, and laws from the Shulhan Arukh on topics
such as the kindling of the Sabbath candles and laws of interposition (hasisah)
relating to the ritual laving of the hands. Shabbetai Zevi incorporated all these
laws in the greatest detail. The halakhic discourse between Shabbetai Zevi and
his followers treats these diverse gestures as ‘laws of the Temple’, that is, laws
practiced and permitted only in the Temple, such as the consumption of a certain
animal fat (helev), as distinct from the customary law practiced outside of the
Temple. The message articulated through this discourse points to his messianic
consciousness, namely his recognition of his own potential as the messiah.

ON THE PUBLICATION OF A BILINGUAL ANTHOLOGY
BY ELIEZER BEN YEHUDA AND HAÏM CALMY

Zohar Shavit (pp. 435–462)

This article examines an obscure bilingual booklet in Hebrew and French,
published in Jerusalem in 1904 and entitled A Compendium of Texts for
Reading/Recueil de morceaux de lecture. This examination sheds new light on
the relationships between Eliezer Ben Yehuda – at once the driving spirit behind
the revival of the Hebrew language and one of the heralds of Jewish territorial
nationalism – and both the Alliance Israélite Universelle (AIU), which rejected
the idea of Jewish territorial nationalism out of hand, and several prominent
figures of the ‘Old Yishuv’. Contrary to the common perception of an uncompromising rivalry between Ben Yehuda, the AIU, and the ‘Old Yishuv’, this project attests to a willingness to join hands. Despite having different worldviews, Ben Yehuda worked together with Haïm Calmy (1851–1933), a teacher at the AIU’s Jerusalem school, and with the Sephardic Rabbi Yaakov Meir (1856–1939) for the publication of the compendium.

The texts selected for inclusion point to an effort to combine Jewish ancestral tradition with the French cultural heritage. The compendium consists of pieces taken from Godchaux Weil’s (Ben Lévi’s) *Les matinées du samedi* (1842) – a Jewish equivalent of a Sunday school reader – side by side with excerpts from works by canonical French writers like Jean Jacques Rousseau and Victor Hugo; from Heinrich Graetz’s *History of the Jews*; and from French popular readers of the time. These texts reflected and expressed the AIU’s understanding of the Jews of France as French people of the Mosaic religion, and they asserted the Jewish-French identity that the AIU wished to impart to the pupils in its schools. Whether in French or in Hebrew, the texts did not even hint at an ideology of national revival in Eretz-Israel.

The compendium also teaches us that despite the AIU’s indifferent and often hostile attitude towards Jewish nationalism, it nonetheless supported the teaching of Hebrew as a living language and hence emphasized Hebrew literacy rather than mere technical proficiency in the language. In fact, the AIU was among the vanguard in introducing the ‘natural’ method of teaching ‘Hebrew in Hebrew’ into its schools, which later became one of the most significant nation-building projects of Zionism and the Yishuv. Ben Yehuda, for his part, joined the venture not only because it helped him financially, but also because he found in it a golden opportunity to secure the standing of Hebrew in the AIU school curriculum. Furthermore, in addition to the publication of this booklet, the AIU also provided generous financial support for the publication of Ben Yehuda’ss dictionary.
CONTENTS

295 Vered Noam: Did the Rabbis Cause the Hasmoneans to be Forgotten? A Reconsideration
335 Mordechai Akiva Friedman: A Complaint to the Sultan against Abraham Maimonides
391 Maoz Cahana: Shabbetai Zevi – the Halakhic Man
435 Zohar Shavit: On the Publication of a Bilingual Anthology by Eliezer Ben Yehuda and Haïm Calmy

Essays in History

463 Cana Werman: On Religious Persecution: A Study in Ancient and Modern Historiography

Books and Reviews

497 Kimmi Caplan: Historical Overviews of the Jews in America: Contexts and Characteristics
509 Nadav Na’aman: Shmuel Ahituv, Esther Eshel, Ze’ev Meshel and Tallay Ornan, To Yhwh of Teman and His Ashera: The Inscriptions and Drawings from Kuntillet ’Ajrud (’Horvat Têman’) in Sinai
515 Joseph Shatzmiller: Simcha Emanuel, Hidden Treasures from Europe
517 Haim Saadoun: The Jews in Algeria and Libya, eds. Moshe Hallamish, Moshe Amar, Moris Romani
523 Yaron Ben-Naeh: Aviad Moreno, Europe from Morocco: The Minutes of the Leadership of Tangier’s Jewish Community (the Junta), 1860–1864
529 Dov Schwartz: Marc B. Shapiro, Changing the Immutable: How Orthodox Judaism Rewrites Its History

Research

Books Received

XXV Summaries