

IYUNIM BITKUMAT ISRAEL

Studies in Zionism, the Yishuv
and the State of Israel

A Research Annual
Volume 4



THE BEN-GURION RESEARCH CENTER • SEDE BOQER CAMPUS
BEN-GURION UNIVERSITY OF THE NEGEV PRESS

1994

- Editor:* Pinhas Ginossar
- Editorial Board:* Meir Avizohar, Israel Oppenheim, Avi Bareli, Pinhas Ginossar, Moshe Lissak, Tuvia Friling
- Advisory Board:* Meir Avizohar, Ben-Gurion Research Center; Menahem Brinker, Hebrew University; Itamar Even-Zohar, Tel-Aviv University; Israel Oppenheim, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev; Pinhas Ginossar, Ben-Gurion Research Center; Allon Gal, Ben-Gurion Research Center; Charles S. Liebman, Bar-Ilan University; Moshe Lissak, Hebrew University; Matiyahu Minc, Tel-Aviv University; Benjamin Pinkus, Ben-Gurion Research Center; Tuvia Friling, Ben-Gurion Research Center; Jonathan Frankel, Hebrew University; Moshe Shemesh, Ben-Gurion Research Center
- Editorial Assistant:* Shulamit Amir-Zarmi

Style Editing: Hamutal Tsamir

Proofs: Nili Hirt

Photo Typesetting: Ruth Erez & Total Graphics

Translations & English Editing: Shulamit Amir-Zarmi

Cover Design: Anat Perl

Cover Photo: Arye Bar-Lev

Production Manager: Shaul Shragai

© 1994

All Rights Reserved

The Ben-Gurion Research Center

Printed in Israel

At Keterpress Enterprises, Jerusalem

CONTENTS

ESSAY

- Eliezer Schweid The Problem of Jewish Identity as a Historical Process 1

RESEARCH

Defence and Foreign Policy

- Elhannan Orren Zionist Responses to the Partition Plan (1937) – and the *Haganah* 35
- Yaacov Shimoni Jordanian, Egyptian and Palestinian 'Orientations' in the Policies of the Jews of Palestine, the Zionist Movement and Nascent Israel 54
- Moshe Shemesh The *Kadesh* Operation and the Suez Campaign: The Middle Eastern Political Background, 1949-1956 66
- Moshe Shemesh Appendix: Gamal Abd al-Nasser: The Secrets Behind the Sinai Attack 98
- Motti Golani Dayan Leads to War: The Role of the Chief of Staff in the Israeli Government Decision to Go to War in October 1956 117
- Zaki Shalom US and Britain's Reactions Following the Exposure of the Israeli Nuclear Reactor in Dimona 136
- Eretz-Israel and the Diaspora
- Isaiah Friedman Herzl and the Uganda Controversy 175
- Richard Breitman and Shlomo Aronson The End of the 'Final Solution'?: Nazi Plans to Ransom Jews in 1944 204
- Tuvia Friling Istanbul, June 1944: The Intriguing Proposal to Menachem Baader 229

Aliya and Settlement

Amir Ben Porat	Opportunity, Désire and the Break into Palestine	278
Yitzhak Greenberg	Utopia in the Negev: The Cooperative Town of Ramon	299
Yuval Dror	The 'Labour Trend' and the Absorption of Mass Immigration, 1948–1953	325

Economy, Society and Interior Policy

Moshe Lissak	Occupational Structure, Occupational Mobility and Status Symbols in the New <i>Yishuv</i> , 1918–1948	345
Ze'ev Zahor	<i>Mapai</i> , <i>Mapam</i> and the Formation of the First Government in Israel, 1949	378

Literature and National Revival

Yaffa Berlovitz	Moshe Smilansky – <i>Benei Arav</i> : The Patronizing Stories	400
Zohar Shavit	The Rise and Fall of Hebrew Literary Centers, 1918–1933	422

Ideological Trends

Amir Bar-Or	<i>Min Hayessod</i> – The Story of a Political Movement	478
Nathan Yanai	David Ben-Gurion's Concept of Citizenship	494
Yehuda Gellman	Zion and Jerusalem: The Jewish State According to Rabbi Abraham Isaac Kook	505

BOOK REVIEWS

Allon Gal	American Jewry – The Lure of Freedom and Prosperity: A Review Essay	515
Ari Avner	<i>Towards the End of the Mandate</i> by Meir Avizohar	542
Assad Ganem	<i>The Arab Minority in Israel: Between Communism and Arab Nationalism, 1965–1991</i> by Elie Rekhess	549
Shalom Ratzabi	<i>Policy and Imagination: Federal Ideas in the Zionist Political Thought – 1917–1948</i> by Yosef Gorny	556

Zaki Shalom	<i>The Lausanne Conference 1949: A Case Study in Middle East Peacemaking</i> by Neil Caplan	562
David Za'it	<i>The Halutz Movement in Poland, 1929–1939</i> by Israel Oppenheim	571

FROM THE ARCHIVES

From Ben-Gurion's 1962 Diary – Remarks by Pinhas Ginossar	587
Under a Magnifying Glass – Remarks by Tuvia Friling	592

FROM AN ADDITIONAL ANGLE – Responses to Previous Articles and Book Reviews

Elhannan Orren	On the Invasion of the Arab Armies as Seen by the Intelligence	605
Haim Golan	The Truth about Brenner's Attitude to Poalei-Zion's Report	607
Shmuel Dotan	'I Cannot Count Myself Amongst the Self-Restrained'	608
Shabtai Tevet	Consternations Concerning the Editor	613
List of Participants		620
List of Books published by The Ben-Gurion Research Center		621
English Abstracts		i

change. Smilansky's separatist views dictated the poetic spirit of the stories of the first group (the Patronizing Stories) which are the subject of this article.

The Rise and Fall of Hebrew Literary Centers, 1918–1933

Zohar Shavit

In this article the author examines the circumstances under which Hebrew literary centers in Europe and the United States developed. She discusses the reasons for the decline of these centers and describes the circumstances under which an attempt was simultaneously made to establish a cultural center in Eretz-Israel.

The term 'Literary Center' refers here exclusively to a certain territory in which an institutionalized group of writers, who shared a feeling of national identity, settled for a certain period of time and produced, regularly and continuously, belletristic texts. They did this with the help of literary institutions such as publishing houses and literary journals, which addressed these texts to a specific group of readers who could support these literary activities, either materially or ideologically.

The article contends that the demise of Hebrew literary centers occurred already at the beginning of the 20th Century, and that in the short period of time, when Hebrew literary centers did exist in Europe, the circumstances of their existence never allowed for a 'standard' course of development, mainly because Hebrew cultural life in Europe did not have any chance of becoming a full cultural system.

In Eretz-Israel the potential of building an encompassing cultural system did exist. When this potential began to take shape, it was almost immediately recognized as a distinguishing mark between Hebrew culture in Europe and the United-States, and that in Eretz-Israel. The understanding that only in Eretz-Israel Hebrew literature could develop and prosper, whereas it could not stand a chance in Europe and the United-States, was gradually comprehended by Hebrew European men of letters. Thirty years of desperate efforts to reconstruct the dying centers in Europe had passed before this understanding became patently clear. But one can almost ascertain that it was quite acceptable after Bialik finally immigrated to Eretz-Israel in 1924.

In Eretz-Israel, under different conditions, there began to emerge a reading public for whom the Hebrew language became the daily spoken and written

language. In Eretz-Israel the option of culture in diglossia did not exist from the very outset, forcing Hebrew literature to develop as a full and stratified system, a process which involved many cultural battles.

It was this option to build a cultural center in Eretz-Israel in which Hebrew literature would keep officially (and fanatically) its monopoly, which served as the prime cause for the decision to establish in Eretz-Israel a center of Hebrew culture, and the main reason for its success to become in less than fifteen years the sovereign center of Hebrew literature in the world.

Min Hayessod – The Story of a Political Movement

Amir Bar-Or

The eruption of the Lavon Affair in the early 1960s brought to light the malfunctioning of Israel's political system. The affair, with all its concomitant political developments, served as both a vehicle for change and adaptation of the informal political system and its transition into a normative and enlightened system as well as a means of deepening public debate in Israel.

One of the more important developments which resulted from the affair was the awakening of Israel's independent public opinion. At the center of this discussion lay an examination of the underlying causes and nature of expressions of criticism voiced by the intellectual circles whose coming to life served as the background for the establishment of the *Min Hayessod* movement.

The main innovation of *Min Hayessod* was its activism. It stimulated the clarification of unanswered questions and created a forum for the expression of ideas which would never have been included on the pre-Six-Days War Israeli public agenda.

The disappearance of *Min Hayessod* from the public eye demonstrated that the Labour Party, the dominant political entity in Israel's political system, found it difficult to include an ideological-critical organization which attempted to combine ideology with political activism within Israeli society. A society which was typified, from the establishment of its political organizations in the 1920s, by high levels of politicization, as well as a continuous process of social change which involved the adaptation of political instruments to a changing socio-political reality.